## EUROPEAN YEARBOOK ON HUMAN RIGHTS 2020

## This publication is supported by



## AUSTRIAN HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTE







United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization



UNI

UNESCO Chair in
Human Rights and Human Security
University of Graz, Austria



# EUROPEAN YEARBOOK ON HUMAN RIGHTS 2020

Edited by
Philip Czech
Lisa Heschl
Karin Lukas
Manfred Nowak
Gerd Oberleitner





Intersentia Ltd 8 Wellington Mews Wellington Street | Cambridge

CB1 1HW | United Kingdom

Tel: +44 1223 736 170

Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

NWV Verlag GmbH Seidengasse 9/OG 2/TOP 2.4

A-1070 Vienna

Tel.: +43 1 796 35 62-24 | Fax: +43 1 796 35 62-25

Email: office@nwv.at

www.nwv.at

Distribution for the UK and

Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)

NBN International

1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley

Milton Keynes MK13 8LD

United Kingdom

Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331

Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV Hoogstraat 139/6 1000 Brussels

Belgium

Tel: +32 (0)800 39 067

Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada Independent Publishers Group Order Department 814 North Franklin Street Chicago, IL 60610 USA

Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985 Email: orders@ipgbook.com

## European Yearbook on Human Rights 2020

© The editors and contributors severally 2020

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: © Vectorstock - Danny Juchtmans

ISBN (NWV) 978-3-7083-1342-9 ISBN (Intersentia) 978-1-78068-972-2 D/2020/7849/171 NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

### Scientific Advisory Board

Kalliope Agapiou-Josephides (Nicosia), Veronique Arnault (Brussels), Heiner Bielefeldt (Erlangen), Bojko Bučar (Ljubljana), Emmanuel Decaux (Paris), Koen De Feyter (Antwerp), Olivier De Schutter (Leuven), Andrew Drzemczewski (Strasbourg), Horst Fischer (Brussels), Jenny Goldschmidt (Utrecht), Felipe Gomez (Bilbao), Jonas Grimheden (FRA, Vienna), Gábor Halmai (Florence), Thomas Hammarberg (former CoE Commissioner for Human Rights), Enver Hasani (Pristina), Kirsten Hastrup (Copenhagen), Walter Kälin (Bern), Dzidek Kedzia (President, EIUC Board), Matthias C. Kettemann (Frankfurt), Renate Kicker (Graz), Morten Kjærum (Lund), Rumyana Kolarova (Sofia), Josip Kregar (Zagreb), Eva Maria Lassen (Copenhagen), Jean-Paul Lehners (Luxembourg), Paul Lemmens (Judge, ECtHR, Leuven), Peter Leuprecht (Montréal), Lauri Mälksoo (Tartu), Carmen Marquez-Carrasco (Sevilla), Fabrizio Marrella (Venice), Iulia Moțoc (Judge, ECtHR, Bucarest), Michael O'Flaherty (Director FRA, Vienna), Margot O'Salomon (LSE, London), Maria Teresa Pizzaro Beleza (Lisbon), Allan Rosas (Judge, ECJ), William Schabas (Middlesex), Alexander Sicilianos (Judge, ECtHR), Markku Suksi (Abo Akademi University), Engelbert Theuermann (Vienna), George Ulrich (Secretary General, EIUC), Mark Villiger (Judge, ECtHR), Knut Vollebæk (Oslo), Ineta Ziemele (Riga).

Intersentia V

## **EDITORS' PREFACE**

Dear readers.

This edition of the European Yearbook on Human Rights has been produced during an unprecedented global health crisis which has had economic, social and humanitarian dimensions, resulting in a severe impact on human rights. COVID-19 exposed the weaknesses of public healthcare systems and access thereto, prevailing structural inequalities and the fragility of the rule of law in times of emergency. Hate speech, fake news, the targeting of vulnerable groups, nationalism and populism have spread alongside the virus and pave the way for the adoption of repressive measures for purposes unrelated to the pandemic. Human rights appear as afterthoughts in the global pandemic rather than as the guiding principles for response and recovery measures. The crisis, however, did not disclose anything new. Instead, it revealed existing human rights protection gaps and exacerbated persistent shortcomings. The European Yearbook on Human Rights has always provided a platform to address contemporary human rights issues and identify weaknesses in the human rights protection system. Even though the topics had been selected well before the pandemic, they remain of great importance for the wider debate on the future of human rights protection in Europe both during and after the crisis.

The European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) and the European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) have ensured stability, security and peace in Europe over the last 70 years in a unique way. Therefore, this year's edition opens with a contribution from the former President of the ECtHR, Linos-Alexander Sicilianos, on 'The European Convention on Human Rights at 70: The Dynamic of a Unique International Instrument'. In his contribution, he reflects on the dynamic the ECHR has developed over the years, creating its 'extraordinary impetus for a protection of human rights'. However, the protection of human rights requires not only strong instruments but also effectively working institutions, and not just in times of crisis. In light of the pandemic, Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, First Deputy Director of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR), in her opinion piece, 'On International Organisations and Responsible Leadership: A Snake Eating its Own Tail', strikes a blow for the need for a new responsible leadership framework for international organisations rooted in strong moral values and being inclusive and peoplecentred in order to make international organisations become truly relevant and able to bring about the change they were founded for.

Intersentia Vii

The subsequent structure of the Yearbook deviates from previous editions. In light of the 30th anniversary of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) in 2019, and its undisputed continuing importance, we have decided to dedicate a whole Part of the Yearbook to the rights of the child. The thematic Part is introduced by Manfred Nowak, the Independent Expert leading the UN Global Study on Children Deprived of Liberty which was presented in late 2019. Despite the achievements of the CRC regarding the protection of children and the recognition of children as rights-holders, data regarding the violations of their rights is still more than disturbing. The Global Study on Children Deprived of Liberty has been a joint effort of various actors, including UN agencies, governments and civil society organisations to capture the magnitude of the respective situations of children worldwide. Manfred Nowak, in this opening contribution, presents the key findings of the study.

By ratifying the CRC, states commit themselves to respect and ensure the rights of all children under their jurisdiction. The effective protection of human rights, however, depends, *inter alia*, on the access to justice when they have been violated. Lorenzo Acconciamessa raises the question whether the legal framework governing the proceedings before the ECtHR guarantees children's access to justice and child sensitive procedures in his contribution 'Bringing the Child's Procedural Rights before the ECtHR through Interpretative Tools: Access to Justice, Participation, Representation'.

One of the major achievements of the CRC was the recognition that children are, as legal subjects, independent rights-holders and not merely legal objects. The right to family life in all its facets has nevertheless traditionally been assessed from the perspective of parents. In their contribution on 'The Child's Right to Family Life: Shifting Sands and Social Science, Lydia Bracken and Conor O'Mahony explore the evolution of the child's right to family life and the role that social science research and the better understanding of family life can play in delineating the parameters of the right to family life and its interplay with the principle of the best interests of the child. The need to interpret the right to family life from a child-centred perspective and to adapt procedural rules accordingly becomes further obvious in parental separation cases. While decisions in such cases often impact the life of children in the most dramatic way, only parents are party to the respective proceedings. In her contribution, 'The ECtHR on Parental Authority and Contact after Separation: Towards a More Child-Centred Perspective?', Evelyn Merckx elaborates on the ECtHR's efforts to acknowledge children's rights in cases of parental separation and on the limits the Court faces due to the subsidiarity and margin of appreciation principles. Conflicting views of parents' and children's rights and the difficulty in balancing these rights have, furthermore, shaped adoption cases and, in particular, cases of compulsory adoption. Anette Faye Jacobsen's contribution, 'Principles and Politics in Compulsory Adoption Cases in the European Court of Human Rights: The Right Balancing of Rights', analyses the relevant case law of the ECtHR in this

viii Intersentia

regard, which has been affected and shaped by wider trans-European controversies concerning the understanding of family ties and the family as a (biological) entity. While compulsory adoption is, in all likelihood, the most intrusive of interventions in the right to family life in the name of the best interests of the child, intercountry adoptions also give rise to important questions in this regard. Wouter Vandenhole thus asks in his contribution on 'Triangulating Children's Rights Law: Which Future for Intercountry Adoptions in Europe?' whether the current trend of declining numbers in intercountry adoptions is a positive or negative trend from a child rights perspective.

Manfred Nowak elaborates on a specific type of child deprived of his or her liberty, namely children who are detained for the purpose of educational supervision ('Detention of Children for the Purpose of Educational Supervision'). While it is beyond doubt that the detention of children gives rise to various human rights concerns, the imprisonment of parents can have detrimental effects on children's rights too. Peggy ter Vrugt dedicates her contribution, 'Rights of Children of Prisoners: Innocent, Forgotten and Punished', to the right to family life and the right to maintain contact with the imprisoned parent of these 'invisible victims', and uses the Dutch practice on this matter as a case study.

The confinement or detention of minors for the duration of their asylum determination procedures, as well as the rights of unaccompanied minors in general, has been heatedly discussed over the last few years. The complex concept of 'migrant children', the protection of their rights and the application of the concept of vulnerability in such cases before the ECtHR and the CRC are discussed by Rebecca Thorburn Stern in her contribution on 'The Image of the Vulnerable Migrant Child in Recent ECtHR and CRC Committee Case Law'.

Of course, the protection of the rights of the child covers the whole range of economic, social and cultural rights. In her contribution on 'Social Rights are also Children's Rights!? An Analysis of the ECSR's Case Law on Children', Katharina Häusler explores the reception of the CRC in Europe by analysing the 'case law' of the European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR) on the social rights of children. One of the most important social rights of children is the right to education. The CRC recognises this legal right of every child on the basis of equal opportunities. Even though, overall, more children than ever are in schools and have access to education, progress has been uneven and unfair. Barriers to the right to education can be associated, inter alia, with gender, poverty, displacement or, most recently, with the COVID-19 pandemic. The contribution 'Inclusive Education in Strasbourg: Still Learning?', by Marie Spinoy and Kurt Willems, is dedicated to the right to inclusive education and analyses how the ECtHR has dealt with the right to education of children with disabilities in its case law. Aida Kisunaite and Simone Delicati subsequently turn to the protection of the rights of the child at the EU level in their contribution 'Children's Rights and the EU: Analysis of Social, Health and Education Laws and Policies'. While the mainstreaming of children's rights and the respective

Intersentia iX

intersectoral policy coordination have been progressively endorsed at EU level, there are still considerable challenges, as revealed by the authors who use social, health and education laws and policies as examples.

The effective protection of the rights of the child requires their effective implementation at the national level. While the CRC does not require state parties to elevate children's rights to the constitutional level, many states have done so by including, at the very least, specific child rights in their constitutions. Domenico Rosani, in his contribution 'The Increasing Recognition of Child Rights by European Constitutions and its Relevance for the Criminal Regulation of Sexting', uses the example of 'sexting' to compare constitutional perspectives and approaches on children's rights in three European states and to analyse how the constitutional acknowledgement of children's rights can influence criminal law.

The next contribution concerns the right of the child to participate in public affairs. While the CRC foresees that children shall have the right to freely express their views in all matters affecting them, and that due weight shall be given to these views, the concept of participation in the context of children's rights remains unclear. Kata Dozsa, in her contribution 'The Inconvenient Truths of the Eco-Generation: Mapping the Role of Children (and Youth) in the Global Climate Change Governance,' reflects on the normative background of the right of the child to participate in decisions regarding measures in the field of climate change, and the tools children have at hand to actively participate in policy-making processes.

The vulnerability of children becomes particularly obvious when they are subjected to armed conflicts and often become direct victims of war and violence. Recruited by state and non-state actors, they participate actively in hostilities as child soldiers. Saeed Bagheri, in his contribution 'Theoretical and Empirical Reflections about the Use of Children in Armed Conflicts: A Case Study of the Afghan Refugee Children Recruited by the IRGC in the Syrian Civil War', analyses the practice of the Iranian Revolutionary Guard Corps to recruit Afghan children as soldiers in the Syrian war from a humanitarian, human rights and refugee law perspective. Child soldiers often suffer severe long-term physical and psychological impacts of armed conflicts and experience extreme difficulties when they are reintegrated into civilian life. Children of 'foreign fighters' or children associated with the so-called Islamic State (IS) experience similar difficulties. In Syria and Iraq, thousands of children in the IS sphere of influence remain in displacement and detention camps and suffer from inhuman conditions and the constant risk of abuse, many of whom have ties to European or other Western states. Still, these states are hesitant to assume responsibility for these children due to short-sighted security considerations. The contribution by Mona Koehler-Schindler and Johannes Heiler on 'Protecting the Rights of the Child while Countering Terrorism: State Policies on Repatriation of Children Associated with "Foreign Fighters" in Syria and Iraq' - which also closes the

X Intersentia

thematic section on the rights of the child – addresses the main human rights implications of different (non-)repatriation policies and promotes a human rights-based approach to the treatment of children allegedly associated with IS.

The third Part of the Yearbook deals with human rights in Europe and beyond. It opens with a contribution by Alessandro Mantelero on 'Regulating AI within the Human Rights Framework: A Roadmapping Methodology'. Rapid developments in the field of Artificial Intelligence (AI) pose a constant challenge to the development of a regulatory framework based on human rights. Regulations need to go beyond legal standards and have to include ethical standards as well as moral and social values.

The need to transcend established legal categories in order to provide effective human rights protection for all is also addressed by Ino Kehrer in her contribution on 'Bodies and Identities beyond the Binary Sex and Gender System: From Question of Order to Question of Rights'. The contribution examines recent rulings passed by the German and Austrian Constitutional Courts which recognise the right to personal identity and the right to personal life of persons who do not identify with the categories provided by the predominant binary sex and gender classification system. Despite the progress made, however, Ino Kehrer calls for a need to ensure the protection of the right to self-determination regardless of any sex or gender attributions.

Courts play a crucial role in the protection of human rights. Over the last decade, the roles of the ECHR and the ECtHR have regularly been challenged by states in the name of state sovereignty. Mikhail Antonov, in his contribution 'Sovereignty and Russian Resistance to Human Rights', analyses the features of Russian legal culture that prioritise state sovereignty, thus preventing the acceptance of human rights. The Part on human rights in Europe and beyond is concluded by reviews of the relevant judgments issued by the European courts in 2019. While Christian Breitler and Martin Traussnigg analyse the jurisprudence of the Court of Justice of the European Union, Stefan Kieber focuses on the judgments of the ECtHR.

Academia, as all other parts of professional life, had to adjust to the novel situation caused by COVID-19. Throughout the whole publication process of this edition, a great amount of flexibility and commitment was required from all partners involved. The editorial team – composed of representatives from the European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy of the University of Graz (UNI-ETC), the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights Vienna (BIM), the Austrian Human Rights Institute of the University of Salzburg and the Global Campus of Human Rights Venice – would like to express their sincere gratitude to all our authors who, despite having to juggle new, online teaching formats, home schooling and the general circumstances of quarantine, managed to submit all contributions on time, allowing for a punctual publication of the Yearbook. We would also like to thank all reviewers whose comments allow us to ensure the high academic standard of our publication and

Intersentia Xi

to improve the Yearbook with every edition. We would furthermore like to thank the Global Campus of Human Rights for the financial support which makes this publication possible. Many thanks go further to Alma Stankovic, who was in charge of the book review process, and to Johanna Tesar and Johanna Binder for their pre-editorial work. And lastly, particular thanks go to Tom Scheirs and Rebecca Moffat from Intersentia for their constant support, their availability and their flexibility during the whole publication process.

Graz, Salzburg, Venice, Vienna – August 2020 Philip Czech, Lisa Heschl, Karin Lukas, Manfred Nowak and Gerd Oberleitner

Xii Intersentia

## **CONTENTS**

| Editors' Prefacevi  |
|---|
| List of Abbreviations   |
| List of Contributors  |
| PART I. INSIGHTS  |
| The European Convention on Human Rights at 70: The Dynamic of a Unique International Instrument (Opinion)   |
| Linos-Alexander Sicilianos  |
| On International Organisations and Responsible Leadership:<br>A Snake Eating its Own Tail<br>(Opinion)  |
| Katarzyna Gardapkhadze  |
| PART II. THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD IN EUROPE AND BEYOND   |
| 30 Years of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Global Study on Children Deprived of Liberty  Manfred Nowak                                    |
| Bringing the Child's Procedural Rights before the ECtHR through Interpretative Tools: Access to Justice, Participation and Representation Lorenzo Acconciamessa |
| The Child's Right to Family Life: Shifting Sands and Social Science  Lydia Bracken and Conor O'Mahony   |
| The ECtHR on Parental Authority and Contact after Separation:  Towards a More Child-Centred Perspective?  Evelyn Merckx   |
| Principles and Politics in Compulsory Adoption Cases in the European Court of Human Rights: The Right Balancing of Rights Anette Faye JACOBSEN                  |

Intersentia Xiii

| Triangulating Children's Rights Law: Which Future for Intercountry Adoptions in Europe?   |
|---|
| Wouter Vandenhole   |
| Detention of Children for the Purpose of Educational Supervision  Manfred Nowak   |
| Rights of Children of Prisoners: Innocent, Forgotten and Punished  Peggy TER VRUGT  |
| The Image of the Vulnerable Migrant Child in Recent ECtHR and CRC Committee Case Law Rebecca Thorburn Stern   |
| Social Rights are also Children's Rights!? An Analysis of the ECSR's  Case Law on Children  Katharina HÄUSLER   |
| Inclusive Education in Strasbourg: Still Learning?  Marie Spinoy and Kurt Willems   |
| Children's Rights and the EU: Analysis of Social, Health and Education Laws and Policies Aida KISUNAITE and Simone DELICATI   |
| The Increasing Recognition of Child Rights by European Constitutions and its Relevance for the Criminal Regulation of Sexting  Domenico Rosani  |
| The Inconvenient Truths of the Eco-Generation: Mapping the Role of Children (and Youth) in the Global Climate Change Governance  Kata Dozsa   |
| Theoretical and Empirical Reflections about the Use of Children in Armed Conflicts: A Case Study of the Afghan Refugee Children Recruited by the IRGC in the Syrian Civil War  Saeed BAGHERI                |
| Protecting the Rights of the Child while Countering Terrorism:  State Policies on Repatriation of Children Associated with  Foreign Fighters' in Syria and Iraq  Mona Koehler-Schindler and Johannes Heiler |

XİV Intersentia

### PART III. HUMAN RIGHTS IN EUROPE AND BEYOND

| Regulating AI within the Human Rights Framework: A Roadmapping Methodology  Alessandro Mantelero   | 7   |
|--|-----|
| Bodies and Identities Beyond the Binary Sex and Gender System: From Question of Order to Question of Rights  | ,   |
| Ino Kehrer   | 13  |
| Sovereignty and Russian Resistance to Human Rights Mikhail Antonov   | 9   |
| The Court of Justice of the European Union and Human Rights in 2019  Christian Breitler and Martin Traussnigg  | 1   |
| The Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights in 2019  Stefan Kieber   | 13  |
| PART IV. BOOK REVIEWS  |     |
| Wolfgang Benedek, Tadesse Kassa Woldetsadik and Tesfaye Abate Abebe (eds.): Implementation of International Human Rights Commitments and the Impact on Ongoing Legal Reforms in Ethiopia  Maria-Angela Brunner | 2.3 |
| Wouter Vandenhole, Gamze Erdem Türkelli and Sara Lembrechts: Children's Rights: A Commentary on the Convention on the Rights of the Child and its Protocols  Betül Durmuş                                      | 27  |
| Doris Angst and Emma Lantschner (eds.): ICERD – Internationales Übereinkommen zur Beseitigung jeder Form von Rassendiskriminierung. Handkommentar  Gregor FISCHER  | 29  |
| Marten Breuer (ed.): Principled Resistance to ECtHR Judgments – A New Paradigm?  | . 1 |

Intersentia XV

| Rosemary Byrne and Han Entzinger (eds.): Human Rights Law   |
|---|
| and Evidence-Based Policy - The Impact of the EU Fundamental  |
| Rights Agency   |
| Teresa Mörth  |
| Markus Kaltenborn, Markus Krajewski and Heike Kuhn (eds.):  |
| Sustainable Development Goals and Human Rights  |
| Magdalena Pfeifenberger   |
| Mark Klaassen, Stephanie Rap, Peter Rodrigues and Ton Liefaard (eds.):<br>Safeguarding Children's Rights in Immigration Law                                       |
| Iro-Lea RADL  |
| Hannah Russel (ed.): The Use of Force and Article 2 of the ECHR in Light of European Conflicts  |
| Christina Seewald   |
| Gamze Erdem Türkelli: Children's Rights and Business: Governing Obligations and Responsibility  |
| Johanna Luise Tesar   |
| Valsamis Mitsilegas, Violeta Moreno-Lax and Niovi Vavoula (eds.):   |
| Securitising Asylum Flows - Deflection, Criminalisation and   |
| Challenges for Human Rights   |
| Julia Wallner   |
| Gerald L. Neuman (ed.): Human Rights in a Time of Populism:<br>Challenges and Responses   |
| David C. Weiss  |
| Logi Gunnarsson, Ulrike Mürbe and Norman Weiß (eds.): The Human Right to a Dignified Existence in an International Context – Legal and Philosophical Perspectives |
| Ursula Werther-Pietsch  |
| Index 653   |

XVi Intersentia

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR American Convention on Human Rights

AG Advocate General
AI Artificial Intelligence

AP ECHR First Additional Protocol to the European Convention on

Human Rights

APPROACH Association for the Protection of All Children

B-VG Bundes-Verfassungsgesetz, Austrian federal constitution

c.p. codice penale, Italian criminal code

CAT United Nations Convention against Torture
CDPC European Committee on Crime Problems

CEAS Common European Asylum System

CFR Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union

CJEU Court of Justice of the European Union

CMW Committee on Migrant Workers

CNDH French National Consultative Commission on Human

Rights

COE Council of Europe
COP Conference of Parties

COPE Children of Prisoners Europe

COs Concurring Opinions

CPSE Communist Party of the Soviet Union
CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRIN Child Rights International Network

CRPD United Nations Convention on the Rights of People with

Disabilities

CSOs Civil society organisations

CSRs Country Specific Recommendations

DOs Dissenting Opinions

DRC Democratic Republic of the Congo

dStGB Deutsches Strafgesetzbuch, German criminal code

Intersentia XVII

EaSI European Union Programme for Employment and Social

Innovation

ECEC Early childhood education and care
ECHR European Convention on Human Rights

ECPT European Convention for the Prevention of Torture

ECSR European Committee of Social Rights
ECtHR European Court of Human Rights
EDPS European Data Protection Supervisor

EP European Parliament

ERDF European Regional Development Funds

ESC European Social Charter ESF European Social Fund

ESIF European Structural and Investment Funds

ETA Euskadi Ta Askatasuna (Basque Homeland and Liberty)

EU European Union

EWHC High Court of Justice of England and Wales
FEAD Fund for European Aid to the Most Deprived

FFF Fridays For Future

GA United Nations General Assembly

GAI Guidelines on Artificial Intelligence and Data Protection
GBD Guidelines on the protection of individuals with regard

to the processing of personal data in a world of Big Data

GC General Comment, Grand Chamber GDPR General Data Protection Regulation

GG Grundgesetz, Basic Law, German constitution

HCHR Helsinki Committee for Human Rights

HUDOC Human Rights Documentation of the European Court of

Human Rights

ICC International Criminal Court

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICDPPC International Conference of Data Protection and

Privacy Commissioners, Declaration on Ethics and Data

Protection in Artificial Intelligence

ICI International Court of Justice

ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTs Information and communication technologies

xviii Intersentia

IO(s) International organisation(s)

IoT The Internet of Things

IRGC Iranian Revolutionary Guard Corps
ISIL Islamic State in Iraq and the Levant

LEA Local educational authority

LGBT+/I Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender/Transsexual plus/

Intersexual

MDAC Mental Disability Advocacy Centre
MEP Member(s) of the European Parliament
MGCY Major Group of Children and Youth

ML Machine learning

NCJ National Council of the Judiciary NGO(s) Non-governmental organisation(s)

OCT Our Children's Trust

ODIHR OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human

Rights

OHCHR Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for

Human Rights

OKB Ouder en Kind Bezoek, Parent and Child visits

OMCT World Organisation Against Torture

OP Optional Protocol(s)

OPCAT Optional Protocol to the United Nations Convention

against Torture

OPIC Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the

Child on a Communication Procedure

OSCE Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe ÖStGB Österreichisches Strafgesetzbuch, Austrian criminal code

PACE Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

PC-CP Council for Penological Co-operation

PPA Penitentiary Principles Act

PStG Personenstandsgesetz, German civil status act RESC Revised European Social Charter of 1996

RF Russian Federation

RF CC Russian Constitutional Court

SC Supreme Court

SDF Syrian Democratic Forces

Intersentia xix

#### List of Abbreviations

SDGs Sustainable Development Goals

TEU Treaty on European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

TNMA Turkish National Music Academy

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UN United Nations

UNCSD United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development

UNEP United Nations Environmental Programme

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural

Organization

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund
UNSC United Nations Security Council

US(A) United States of America

USSR Union of Soviet Socialist Republics

VCLT 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

Youth Employment Initiative

VSC Variation of sex characteristic
WEF World Economic Forum
WZB Berlin Social Science Center

YEI

YOUNGO Youth Non-Governmental Organisation

XX Intersentia

## LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

#### Lorenzo ACCONCIAMESSA

Lorenzo Acconciamessa is a PhD student in 'Human Rights: Evolution, Protection and Limits' at the University of Palermo, Italy. His research project deals with the protection of human rights in the context of the inter-systemic relationships in the international legal order. His other research fields are international children's rights law and the law and practice of international courts and tribunals. He is a teaching assistant of public international law and international human rights law at the Catholic University of Milan, Italy, where he obtained a Master's degree in law in 2019. He also works as a trainee lawyer in the fields of family and juvenile law, children's protection, private international law and human rights protection.

#### Mikhail ANTONOV

Mikhail Antonov is Professor of Law associated with the Law Faculty at the National Research University 'Higher School of Economics', Saint Petersburg, Russia, where he teaches legal theory and comparative law. He holds PhD degrees from Saint Petersburg State University (2006) and Leiden University (2019). Professor Antonov's research interests focus on the problems of normativity in law. He is also practicing as a member of the Saint Petersburg Bar Association

#### Saeed BAGHERI

Saeed Bagheri is a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Law School of the University of Reading, UK. Prior to this, he was a Max Weber Postdoctoral Fellow at the European University Institute (2017–19). Bagheri is a member of the Global Law at Reading (GLAR) grouping and an associate member of the Australian and New Zealand Society of International Law (ANZSIL). He is also serving as the Oxford Human Rights Hub's Regional Correspondent for the Middle East. Bagheri has been a visiting fellow at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge, UK (Summer 2018), a visiting scholar at the Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies of Leiden University Law School, the Netherlands (Spring 2018), and a visiting lecturer at the University College London (UCL), UK (Spring 2018). His primary areas of research and teaching are international law on the use of force, the law of armed conflict and human rights law.

Intersentia XXI

#### Lydia BRACKEN

Lydia Bracken is a lecturer at the School of Law at the University of Limerick, Ireland, where she is also Assistant Dean, Equality, Diversity and Inclusion in the Faculty of Arts Humanities and Social Sciences. She teaches and researches in the areas of child and family law, with a particular focus on examining the legal recognition of 'non-traditional' and 'new' family forms and exploring how such recognition can be provided in a manner that respects the rights and interests of children. Her monograph, *Same-Sex Parenting and the Best Interests Principle*, was published by Cambridge University Press in 2020.

#### **Christian BREITLER**

Christian Breitler is a member of the European Law Department of the Office of the Legal Service of the Austrian Foreign Ministry ('Office of the Legal Adviser', 'Völkerrechtsbüro'). Prior to that, he was a research and teaching assistant at the Institute of European Law at the University of Graz, Austria. His research interests include EU fundamental rights law, EU external relations law and the EU system of judicial protection.

#### Philip CZECH

Philip Czech holds a Dr. iur. and a Dr. phil. degree. Since 2002 he has been a researcher at the Austrian Institute for Human Rights, which became a department of the University of Salzburg, Austria, in 2014. He is editor of *Newsletter Menschenrechte*, a periodical reporting in German on the current case law of the European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR). He is mainly engaged with publishing and teaching in the field of fundamental rights, especially the case law of the ECtHR and its transposition in Austria. His other main fields of interest are asylum and migration law, the freedom of reproductive choice and family law, as well as human rights in the penitentiary system.

#### Simone DELICATI

Simone Delicati is a Master's student in 'Human rights and multi-level governance' at the Department of Political Science, Law and International Studies of the University of Padua, Italy. He holds a Bachelor's degree in political sciences, international relations and human rights from the University of Padua and has been an Erasmus student at the University of Reading, UK, and the University of Antwerp, Belgium. His research activity focuses on children's rights, refugee rights and the relationship between religion and human rights.

#### Kata DOZSA

Kata Dozsa is a PhD researcher in law in the Law and Development Research Group of the University of Antwerp, Belgium. She is a lawyer and a journalist by training, and she also holds an Advanced Master of Children's Rights from the University of Fribourg and the Institute of Kurt Bosch, Switzerland. She started her career in 2003 as a journalist at major newspapers in Hungary. After moving

XXII Intersentia

to Belgium in 2007, she worked for the European Commission, among others, as a press officer for Climate Action, and as a policy officer for the rights of the child. Her PhD research focuses on the participation of children and young people in climate change governance.

#### Katarzyna GARDAPKHADZE

Katarzyna Gardapkhadze has been the First Deputy Director of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) since 2016. Before that, she served as the Head of ODIHR's Human Rights Department. Katarzyna has 25 years of experience in public service, international non-profits and multilateral organisations in Europe, North America, South Caucasus and Central Asia. Before joining the OSCE, she was a Director in Save the Children based in Tbilisi, Georgia. She has also contributed to various initiatives, from the Eurasia Foundation's South Caucasus media support programme and USAID-funded Georgia youth peace project, to community strengthening work with the United Nations Mission in Kosovo. Educated in social sciences, Katarzyna is a graduate of Stanford Leadership Academy for Development and a certified trainer (Institute for Leadership & Management).

#### Katharina HÄUSLER

Katharina Häusler graduated from the University of Vienna, Austria, with degrees in law and political science, before studying a Master's in Human Rights and Democratisation at the European Inter-University Centre for Human Rights in Venice, Italy, and the Université de Montpellier I, France (EMA 2009). In 2017 she completed her PhD at the University of Vienna with a case law study on selected social rights of children in Europe (Brill Njihoff 2019). Her research interests include European human rights law and policy, children's rights, environmental law, and migration and asylum law. She currently works as an associate at a Viennese law firm specialised in public law.

#### **Johannes HEILER**

Johannes Heiler has served as Adviser on Anti-Terrorism Issues in the Human Rights Department of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) since September 2016. He joined ODIHR in August 2013 and worked in different capacities, including as Human Rights Adviser responsible for the implementation of projects to promote the protection of human rights defenders in the OSCE region. From 2003 to 2013 he worked at the International Secretariat of Amnesty International, where he was primarily engaged in human rights law and policy and conducted advocacy work on a broad range of country-related and thematic issues with international organisations and regional human rights mechanisms, including the United Nations, the Council of Europe and the African Union. He holds a Master's degree in political science from the University of Hamburg, Germany, as well as a European Master's degree in Human Rights and Democratisation (EMA).

Intersentia XXIII

#### Lisa HESCHL

Lisa Heschl is a post-doctoral research and teaching fellow at the European Training and Research Centre on Human Rights and Democracy at the University of Graz (UNI-ETC), Austria. She received her PhD in law from the University of Graz and holds a European Master's degree in Human Rights and Democratisation (EMA). She has been a Marie Curie visiting research fellow at the University of Deusto, Bilbao, Spain, and is a visiting lecturer at the University Oldenburg, Germany, and the University of Padua, Italy. Her research focuses on European migration and asylum policy and legislation, the extraterritorial application of international and European refugee and human rights law and its relation to European border policies, in which she has published widely.

#### **Anette Faye JACOBSEN**

Anette Faye Jacobsen holds a PhD in legal and political history. She is a senior researcher at the Danish Institute for Human Rights with a specialisation in developments in children's rights, in particular child protection, from the international instruments in the UN and the Council of Europe systems, to domestic implementation in state as well as municipal administration. She is a member of the Danish inspection team of the UN Convention against Torture to children's institutions and has acted as an advisor to the Danish government on child rights issues.

#### Ino KEHRER

Ino Kehrer is a PhD student of the international joint PhD programme 'Human Rights, Society and Multi-Level Governance' coordinated by the Human Rights Centre of the University of Padua, Italy, and part of the group 'intersexioni'. She graduated in law from the Alma Mater Studiorum, University of Bologna, Italy. Her research focuses on the intersectionalities between biology, sociology and law in theory and practice. In her research through a comparative study, she examines the challenges to the protection of sex and gender diversity stemming from dichotomous legal categories under international human rights law. Her most recent co-authored publication is *The Bio-medicalization of Intersex Variations between Medical and Parental Authority* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2020).

#### Stefan KIEBER

Stefan Kieber is Senior Scientist at the Austria Institute for Human Rights (University of Salzburg, Austria). His main research fields are human rights in general, the case law of the ECtHR and the implementation of international (human rights) obligations in national law. He is also Chief Editor of the academic journal *Newsletter Menschenrechte*.

#### Aida KISUNAITE

Aida Kisunaite is a researcher in in the Department of Political Science, Law and International Studies and the principal investigator in the project 'CRIMG – Mainstreaming of children's rights: multilevel governance perspective' (2018–20) at

XXİV Intersentia

the University of Padua, Italy. She is a former Director of the Interdisciplinary Research Center for Children Rights (IRCCR). Dr Kisunaite is an academic lawyer and political scientist working in the field of human rights, focusing particularly on groups of the most vulnerable children and young people. Dr Kisunaite has participated in various international multi-disciplinary research teams working on European policy issues, with a major focus on social and health policies and the role of different stakeholders in the policy cycle.

#### Mona KOEHLER-SCHINDLER

Mona Koehler-Schindler currently serves as Associate Human Rights Officer on Anti-Terrorism Issues at the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR). Prior to joining ODIHR, she worked as a member of NATO's International Staff in Afghanistan and Belgium. From 2017 to 2019, she served as Political Advisor to the NATO Senior Civilian Representative to Afghanistan, providing political assessments and supporting civil-military cooperation in the country. Before that she served in different capacities at NATO HQ in Brussels, including in the Counter-Terrorism Section, the Science for Peace and Security Programme and the Strategic Analysis Capability Centre. Previously, she worked, amongst others, for the German Federal Enterprise for International Cooperation (GIZ) in the Police Programme Africa components in Cameroon and Chad, focusing on security sector reform in the counter-terrorism context. She holds a Master's degree in international relations and French from the University of Aberdeen, UK.

#### Karin LUKAS

Karin Lukas is Senior Researcher and Head of Department at the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights, Austria. In January 2011, she joined the European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR) of the Council of Europe and since 2017, has been its Vice-President. She has been a consultant for various national and international organisations, such as the UN Development Programme and the Austrian Ministry for Foreign Affairs. She has researched and carried out project-related activities in the field of human rights, in particular women's rights, development cooperation and business. Ms Lukas holds an LLM in gender and the law (American University, Washington DC) an EMA in Human Rights and Democratisation (University of Padua, Italy) and a PhD in legal studies (University of Vienna, Austria). She currently works on the issue of labour rights in global production networks, and international, as well as company-based, grievance mechanisms.

#### Alessandro MANTELERO

Alessandro Mantelero is Associate Professor of Private Law and Data Ethics & Data Protection at Polytechnic University of Turin, Italy. He is Council of Europe Scientific Expert on AI, data protection and human rights, and has served as an expert on data regulation for several organisations, including the UN, the EU FRA and the European Commission.

Intersentia XXV

#### **Evelyn MERCKX**

Evelyn Merckx is a PhD candidate and teaching assistant at the Human Rights Centre and the Department of European, Public and International Law, Ghent University, Belgium. She is involved in teaching human rights law and conducts research on the intersection between children's rights and family law. Her PhD topic focuses on children's rights and child-friendly justice in the context of parental separation.

#### Manfred NOWAK

Manfred Nowak is Professor of Human Rights at the University of Vienna, Austria, and Secretary General of the Global Campus of Human Rights in Venice, Italy. He served as Director of the Netherlands Institute of Human Rights at Utrecht University from 1987 to 1989 and as Director of the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights at Vienna from 1992 to 2019. He has also been a Visiting Professor at the University of Lund, the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies in Geneva, and Stanford University. Simultaneously, Manfred Nowak served in various expert functions, such as United Nations expert on enforced disappearances (1993-2006), UN Special Rapporteur on Torture (2004-2010), judge at the Human Rights Chamber for Bosnia and Herzegovina (1996-2003) and Vice Chair of the European Union Fundamental Rights Agency (2013-2018). In 2016, he was appointed Independent Expert to lead the UN Global Study on Children Deprived of Liberty which he presented to the UN General Assembly in 2019. Manfred Nowak is the author of more than 600 publications in the fields of public and international law and human rights.

#### Conor O'MAHONY

Conor O'Mahony is a senior lecturer at the Centre for Children's Rights and Family Law at the School of Law at University College Cork, Ireland, where he is also the Director of the Child Law Clinic. His publications are primarily in the areas of constitutional law, children's rights and child protection, and he has acted as Principal Investigator on projects funded by the European Commission and Irish Government in these areas. In 2019, he was appointed by the Irish Government as Special Rapporteur on Child Protection for a three-year term.

#### Gerd OBERLEITNER

Gerd Oberleitner is UNESCO Chair in Human Rights and Human Security at the Faculty of Law and Director of the European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy at the University of Graz, Austria. He has been a lecturer at the Centre for the Study of Human Rights of the London School of Economics and Political Science, UK, and Visiting Professor at the European Inter-University Centre Venice, Italy, the Université du Quebéc à Montréal, Canada, the Universities of Ljubljana, Slovenia, and Bochum, Germany, and Rutgers University, New Jersey. He teaches in the Global Campus of Human Rights.

XXVİ Intersentia

#### Domenico ROSANI

Domenico Rosani is a research and teaching associate at the Italian Law Department of the University of Innsbruck, Austria. He previously worked as a trainee for the EU Fundamental Rights Agency, where he was part of the Sector for the Rights of the Child. His main area of research deals with the criminal relevance of children's activities on the Internet from a comparative and international perspective. Scientifically, he has also worked on privacy and data protection, biolaw, child migration and juvenile justice.

#### Linos-Alexander SICILIANOS

Linos-Alexander Sicilianos, Professor Dr., Dr. h.c., is a Judge and former President of the European Court of Human Rights. He is also a member of the Institute of International Law, a member of the Permanent Court of Arbitration, a member of the Curatorium of the Hague Academy of International Law, an associate member of the Academy of Athens and Professor (on leave) of the University of Athens, Greece. He has been President of the Committee of the Council of Europe for the Improvement of Procedures for the Protection of Human Rights, Rapporteur and Vice-President of the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, a member of the Administrative and the Executive Board of the Fundamental Rights Agency and Vice-President of the Greek National Commission on Human Rights. He is also Visiting Professor in a number of European universities, academies and institutes as well as the author of numerous publications in English, French and Greek in general international law, human rights law and international organisations.

#### Marie SPINOY

Marie Spinoy is a PhD researcher in the area of discrimination law at the Leuven Centre for Public Law at KU Leuven, Belgium. Prior to this she obtained the degrees of Research Master of Law (KU Leuven and Tilburg University, the Netherlands) and Magister Juris (University of Oxford, UK). Her research interests include anti-discrimination law, the rights of persons with disabilities and human rights law.

#### **Peggy TER VRUGT**

Peggy ter Vrugt is a junior researcher in the Department of Criminal Law and Criminology of Maastricht University, the Netherlands. She is currently involved in a European Commission funded research project on the right to silence during police interrogations (EmpRiSe). Previously, Peggy taught various courses in the fields of international and European law and criminal law at Maastricht University. She holds two Master degrees in human rights law and criminal law from Maastricht University. In 2019, she received the Max van der Stoel Human Rights Award for her master thesis on rights of children of imprisoned mothers in the Netherlands. Her research interests lie at the interface between human

Intersentia XXVII

rights and criminal law, including (but not limited to) fair trial rights, children involved in the criminal justice system and vulnerable suspects.

#### Rebecca THORBURN STERN

Rebecca Thorburn Stern is Professor of Public International Law at the Faculty of Law of Uppsala University, Sweden. Her research focuses on the human rights of children, in particular the right to participation, asylum law and the relationship between international and domestic law. She has published extensively in these fields.

#### Martin TRAUSSNIGG

Martin Traussnigg is a member of the scientific staff at the Constitutional Court of Austria. Prior to that, he was a research and teaching assistant at the Institute of European Law at the University of Graz, Austria, and a member of the Styrian Provincial Government Legal Service. He is a doctoral candidate at the University of Vienna, Austria, in the field of constitutional and administrative law.

#### Wouter VANDENHOLE

Wouter Vandenhole is a human rights and law-and-development scholar. He holds the Human Rights Chair at the Law Faculty of the University of Antwerp, Belgium, and is a member of the Law and Development Research Group. Between 2007 and 2018, he also held the UNICEF Chair in Children's Rights. His research interests include children's rights, economic, social and cultural rights, and the relationship between human rights law and development.

#### **Kurt WILLEMS**

Kurt Willems is Professor of Education Law and Administrative Law at KU Leuven, Belgium and Head of the Leuven Centre for Public Law. He is a judge in the Appeal Chamber for disciplinary measures against educators of subsidised schools and a member of the Council on pupils' rights.

XXVIII Intersentia